Southern Arizona Anti-Trafficking United Response Network

SAATURN: Evaluation

Qualtrics Survey Results

_Semi-Annual Qualtrics Report: 10/1/15-3/31/16_

August 2016
Southern Arizona Anti-Trafficking United Response Network (SAATURN)

Evaluation Findings:
Qualtrics Survey Results
October 1, 2015 – March 31, 2016

Sally Stevens, PhD
Candace Black, PhD
Southwest Institute for Research on Women
University of Arizona

August 2016

Funded by:
Department of Justice
Office for Victims of Crime
#2015-VT-BX-K006-ECM
&
Department of Justice
Bureau of Justice Assistance
#2015-VT-BX-K0048
Acknowledgements
SIROW wishes to acknowledge the contributions of the Tucson Police Department, CODAC Health Recovery and Wellness, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, and Federal Bureau of Investigation to this evaluation. In addition, SIROW is appreciative of support from the Bureau of Justice Assistance, Office of Justice Programs, and Office for Victims of Crime.

Disclaimer
The development of this report is supported by grant number #2015-VT-BX-K006-ECM, awarded by the Office for Victims of Crime—U.S. Department of Justice and #2015-VT-BX-K0048, awarded by the Bureau of Justice Assistance—U.S. Department of Justice. The opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this report are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the Department of Justice; nor does mention of trade names, commercial practices, or organizations imply endorsement by the U.S. Government.

Suggested Citation
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METHOD</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESULTS</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey Respondents</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of SAATURN Progress by Amount of Progress</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAATURN - Substantial or Moderate Progress</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAATURN - Progress Unknown</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAATURN - Limited or No Progress</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of SAATURN by Areas of Inquiry/Subscales</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership and regulatory issues</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 1 - Developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 2 - Strengthening interagency communications between victim services and law enforcement.</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 3 - Changing rules, regulations, standards guidelines, and/or practice protocols</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 4 - Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for victim services.</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 5 - Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for law enforcement strategies and activities</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 6 - Implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN’s goals.</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Issues</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 1 - Developing and standardizing training materials including terms and definitions.</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 2 - Training on victim screening and identification criteria</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 3 - Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 4 - Training on identification of illegal trafficking activity</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 5 - Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrests and convictions of trafficking offenders and/or the other matters related to human trafficking activity.</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 6 - Training or activities to increase general public awareness of human trafficking issues.</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advocacy Issues</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 1 - Engaging high level policy or decision makers at the local or regional level.</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 2 - Engaging victims of trafficking in SAATURN so that their views and voices are represented.</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item 3 - Cultivating partnerships with other key stakeholders</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Item 4 - Expanding the victim services provider network to provide more services and more comprehensive services. ................................................................. 21

Item 5 - Establishing contact information for SAATURN (e.g., online; phone hotline). .......... 21

Item 6 - Using social media or other avenues of information dissemination to increase general public support for victim and prosecutorial efforts in human trafficking issues. .......... 22

Client Services Issues ........................................................................ 23

Item 1 - Creating or expanding a broad array of services. ............................................. 23

Item 2 - Collaborating and coordinating between victim services organizations in Southern Arizona. ......................................................................................... 23

Item 3 - Victim identification, screening, and timely access to services. ......................... 23

Item 4 - The use of evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services. ................................................................. 24

Item 5 - Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender issues. ..................................................... 24

Law Enforcement and Prosecution ................................................................ 25

Item 1 – Creating or expanding a broad array of strategies to advance law enforcement and prosecution efforts. ......................................................... 25

Item 2 – Collaborating and coordinating between law enforcement agencies in Southern Arizona. ................................................................................. 25

Item 3 – Identification and timely arrest, arraignment, due-process, and convictions of trafficking offenders. ............................................................. 26

Item 4 – Using evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrest and conviction of offenders of human trafficking. ............... 26

Item 5 – Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender bias. ...................................................... 27

Financing Issues ..................................................................................... 28

Item 1 – Filling gaps in services through new funding or interagency agreements and partnerships. ......................................................................................... 28

Item 2 – Creating or improving financing mechanisms and using funding resources strategically. ......................................................................................... 28

Item 3 – Conducting cross training or other activities to address sustaining issues. .......... 29

Successes, Challenges, and Recommendations ........................................... 29

Appendix A - Qualtrics Survey .................................................................... 32

Appendix B - Figures for all Likert-Scale Items ............................................. 37

Appendix C - Secondary and Tertiary Analyses ............................................ 44
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
The Southern Arizona Anti-Trafficking Unified Response Network (SAATURN), initiated in October 2015, is situated in Pima, Cochise, and Santa Cruz counties in Southern Arizona. The comprehensive effort of SAATURN is expected to: (1) improve the prosecutions of these crimes; (2) educate the public, first responders, and service providers on recognizing potential victims of trafficking through training; and (3) increase the delivery of services for victims.

The University of Arizona – Southwest Institute for Research on Women (UA-SIROW) provides an external evaluation of the development, activities, and progress of SAATURN. To assess SAATURN’s progress on a biannual basis, the UA-SIROW evaluation team conducts an online survey soliciting feedback from SAATURN’s stakeholders with regard to perceived progress in six coalition building areas. A summary of findings, based on 32 responses to the survey, for the October 2015 – March 2016 reporting period include the following:

Substantial progress was made with regard to:

- Developing and maintaining an organized, effective, and unified response network
- Collaborating and coordinating between law enforcement agencies in Southern Arizona
- Strengthening interagency communications between victim services and law enforcement
- Creating or expanding a broad array of strategies to advance law enforcement and prosecution efforts
- Developing and standardizing training materials including terms and definitions
- Cultivating partnerships with other key stakeholders

Progress was unknown in many areas. Six areas noted most frequently as “progress unknown” include:

- Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender bias (law enforcement and prosecution)
- Creating or improving financing mechanisms and using resources strategically
- Filling gaps in service through new funding or interagency agreements and partnerships
- Conducting cross training or other activities to address sustaining issues
- Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender issues (client services)
- Identification and timely arrest, arraignment, due process, and convictions of trafficking offenders

The seven most frequently cited areas in which there was limited or no progress include:

- Creating or adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for victim services
- Using social media or other avenues of information dissemination to increase general public support for victim and prosecutorial efforts in human trafficking issues
- Changing rule, regulations, standards guidelines, and/or practice protocols
- Creating or adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for law enforcement strategies and activities
- Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services
- Engaging in high level policy or decision makers at the local or regional level
- Establishing contact information for SAATURN (e.g., online; phone hotline)
Implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN’s goals

The perceived progress is substantial and quite impressive for a new coalition. Perceived advances relate to developing, collaborating, coordinating, cultivating and strengthening inter- and intra-agency work with regard to human trafficking. Also as expected, given that this reporting period covers the start-up period, respondents reported several areas in which progress was unknown or limited. We expect that as the coalition matures, progress in these areas will be made.

General findings related to the survey include:

- Overall, SAATURN made substantial progress in areas in which progress was expected—that is, in coalition building.
- Areas with limited progress were typically those that involved more time-intensive start-up activities that build on SAATUN’s coalition building successes, as well as decisions, protocols and financing activities that are based on the groundwork and establishment of the coalition.
- Cross-group knowledge of progress was somewhat limited—those in law enforcement more generally did not know of progress related to victim services, and victim services respondents were more generally unaware of progress made in law enforcement.
- Overall, activities related to law enforcement were perceived as making more progress as compared to victim services.
- Areas within law enforcement that were most frequently perceived as having made substantial progress include creating or expanding a broad array of strategies to advance law enforcement, as well as collaborating and coordinating between law enforcement agencies.
- Substantial progress was noted for training issues—particularly developing and standardizing training materials and training on the identification of illegal trafficking activities.

As the groundwork for building the SAATURN is assembled, progress in other areas should follow. As SAATURN matures and information is shared, one would expect knowledge of progress across topics and across subgroups of professions (e.g., law enforcement, victim services, other) will also increase. Overall, substantial progress was made during this reporting period due to the efforts of SAATURN.
INTRODUCTION
The Tucson Police Department (TPD) and CODAC Health Recovery and Wellness, Inc. (CODAC) were awarded a three-year grant from the Department of Justice—Office for Victims of Crime (#2015-VT-BX-K006-ECM) and Department of Justice—Bureau of Justice Assistance (#2015-VT-BX-K0048) for the development of a human trafficking taskforce for Southern Arizona. The taskforce, formally known as the Southern Arizona Anti-Trafficking Unified Response Network (SAATURN) is situated in Pima, Cochise, and Santa Cruz counties in southern Arizona located on the United States (U.S.) - Mexico international boarder. SAATURN's membership includes law enforcement agencies, service providers, and other stakeholders and is assisted by collaborators such as the Mexican Consulate in Tucson (Pima County) and Nogales (Santa Cruz County).

While law enforcement maintains its presence along the international border between Arizona and Mexico, people in these communities remain at high risk for exploitation, due to the lack of resources necessary to investigate and prosecute the perpetrators of trafficking, the lack of awareness with regard to human trafficking, and the lack of services to meet the needs of human trafficking victims. The comprehensive effort of SAATURN is expected to: (1) improve the prosecutions of these crimes; (2) educate the public, first responders, and service providers on recognizing potential victims of trafficking through training; and (3) increase the delivery of services for victims.

The University of Arizona – Southwest Institute for Research on Women (UA-SIROW) is contracted to provide an external evaluation of the development, activities, and progress of SAATURN. As part of the evaluation, the SIROW evaluation team accesses taskforce members and other stakeholder’s perception of SAATURN’s progress in achieving its goals on a bi-annual basis (October - March and April - September) during the three-year project period. A confidential online survey using Qualtrics software was developed to collect this information. This report presents findings of the de-identified data for the first six-month project period, October 2015 - March 2016.

METHOD
The Qualtrics survey (see Appendix A) includes six demographic questions, including age, gender, race, county, subcommittee membership, and primary occupation. These questions are followed by a series of questions that address six key development areas for SAATURN: (1) leadership and regulatory issues; (2) training; (3) advocacy; (4) client services; (5) law enforcement and prosecution; and (6) financing. Each area of questioning (subcales) have between three and six questions each which are answered using a 5-point Likert scale (substantial progress, some progress, limited progress, no progress, and don’t know). Each subscale also includes two open-ended items that ask about SAATURN’s greatest achievements and barriers for that particular focus area. There are three additional open-ended items at the end of the survey asking about the three greatest advancements or successes of SAATURN, new trends and activities, and specific issues that SAATURN should address in the next 6-12 months. The survey and other SAATURN evaluation activities and protocols were reviewed and approved by the UA-Human Subjects Internal Review Board prior to its administration.

Names and email addresses for potential survey respondents were collected at various SAATURN meetings during the initial start-up period October, 2015 - March 2016. A total of 88 surveys were emailed to SAATURN taskforce members and other stakeholders during the first week of April 2016.
Two reminders to complete the survey were emailed to those who did not complete the survey. The survey closed on April 22, 2016.

RESULTS
Thirty-two participants responded to the survey invitation, resulting in a 36% response rate—a low to average response rate\(^1\). The SIROW evaluation team expected a relatively low response rate due to the fact that the coalition was in its early organizational stage following funding. Of the 32 participants, three partially responded by completing only the first subscale on leadership and regulatory issues. Of the three partial respondents, two were victim service providers and one was a law enforcement agency provider.

The data presented in the following sections of this report includes: (1) demographic information with regard to the survey respondents; (2) perception of SAATURN’s progress by amount of progress made; (3) perception of SAATURN’s progress by area of inquiry; (4) conclusions and recommendations; and (5) appendices to the report.

Survey Respondents
Table 1 (below) presents demographic data with regard to the survey respondents. Over three-quarters (78%) of the respondents were female and 69% of the respondents were Caucasian. As expected, most of the respondents were from Pima County (78%), given that SAATURN efforts began in Pima County and the county is much larger in size and population compared to Cochise and Santa Cruz counties. Over one-third (34%) of respondents reported not serving on a SAATURN subcommittee, while approximately equal percentage served on the victim services subcommittee (25%) or the law enforcement subcommittee (28%). Just over one-third (37%) of respondents’ primary occupation was in victim services, while just under one-third (31%) reported that their primary occupation was in law enforcement.

Table 1. *Demographics of the survey respondents.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Number of Participants (n = 32)</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transgender</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Number of Participants (n = 32)</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asian/Pacific Islander</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black/African American</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caucasian/White</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latina/o</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Eastern</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Race</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Perception of SAATURN Progress by Amount of Progress

The following analyses refer to the 31 Likert-scale items in the Qualtrics survey. The original five response options (substantial progress, some progress, limited progress, no progress, and don’t know) were collapsed into three categories: substantial or moderate progress, limited or no progress, and progress unknown. Tables 2-4 present the frequencies of endorsements for each response category, collapsed across all occupational groups. Table 2 focuses on areas in which substantial or moderate progress has been made, Table 3 focuses on areas where progress is unknown, and Table 4 focuses on areas where limited or no progress has been made. The tables corresponding to each response category reflect different criteria for item retention; specifically, for Table 2, only those statements for which at least 50% of the respondents believe SAATURN has made substantial or moderate progress were retained, while a criterion of 40% of respondents was selected for Table 3 (i.e., at least 40% of respondents indicated that they did not know how much progress was made in those areas), and a criterion of 25% of respondents was selected for Table 4.

SAATURN - Substantial or Moderate Progress. Table 2 (below) indicates that, in terms of developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network, 72% of all respondents endorsed the statement that SAATURN has made substantial or moderate progress, and 69% of all respondents believe that substantial or moderate progress has been made in terms of collaborating and coordinating between
Law enforcement agencies in Southern Arizona. This high percent of endorsement is noteworthy given that SAATURN is in the early stages of coalition building. Survey respondents indicated that SAATURN made substantial or moderate progress in activities corresponding to organizational development, including increasing collaborative activities, strengthening communications, cultivating partnerships, and developing and standardizing training materials. In fact, this broad area of successful organizational development was referred to in 85% of the substantive responses to the open-ended, general survey question asking about SAATURN’s greatest advancements from October 2015 to March 2016.

Table 2. Areas in which SAATURN has made substantial or moderate progress from October 2015 - March 2016.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SAATURN has made substantial or moderate progress</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaborating and coordinating between law enforcement agencies in Southern Arizona</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthening interagency communications between victim services and law enforcement</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creating or expanding a broad array of strategies to advance law enforcement and prosecution efforts</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing and standardizing training materials including terms and definitions</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultivating partnerships with other key stakeholders</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Percentage of respondents (all occupations) who report that SAATURN has made substantial or some (moderate) progress in these domains. A criterion of greater than or equal to 50% of the sample was applied to select which items to report. Sample size is n=29, except where indicated.

2 Sample size is n=32.

SAATURN - Progress Unknown. Table 3 (below) indicates that many of the respondents did not know what progress had been made during the first six months of the project. Areas of unknown progress are important to identify because they allow stakeholders to assess which areas need attention and development, and can be prioritized according to the coalition’s strategic priorities. As Table 3 indicates, the top four topics respondents did not know about included: (1) utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender bias (law enforcement and prosecution; 62% of respondents); (2) creating or improving financing mechanisms and using funding resources strategically (62%); (3) filling gaps in services through new funding or interagency agreements and partnerships (59%); and (4) conducting cross training or other activities to address sustaining issues (59%). The high percentage of respondents “not knowing” was expected given that SAATURN is in the early stages of coalition building, with these data being based on the first six months of the project. In addition, there is no reason to expect that all taskforce members and stakeholders would have information on all of the areas. For example, a direct service provider (e.g. counselor) might not typically have information about creating or improving financing mechanisms and using funding resources strategically.
Table 3. *Areas in which the progress SAATURN has made is unknown from October 2015 - March 2016.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SAATURN’s progress is unknown</th>
<th>% 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender bias (law enforcement and prosecution)</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creating or improving financing mechanisms and using funding resources strategically</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filling gaps in services through new funding or interagency agreements and partnerships</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conducting cross training or other activities to address sustaining issues</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender issues (client services)</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identification and timely arrest, arraignment, due-process, and convictions of trafficking offenders</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrests and convictions of trafficking offenders and/or the other matters related to human trafficking activity</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The use of evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrest and conviction of offenders of human trafficking</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using social media or other avenues of information dissemination to increase general public support for victim and prosecutorial efforts in human trafficking issues</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN goals</td>
<td>47% 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engaging high level policy or decision makers at the local or regional level</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creating or expanding a broad array of services</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training on victim screening and identification criteria</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engaging victims of trafficking in SAATURN so that their views and voices are represented</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victim identification, screening, and timely access to services</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Percentage of respondents (all occupations) who report that they do not know whether SAATURN has made progress in these domains. A criterion of greater than or equal to 40% of the sample was applied to select which items to report. Sample size is n=29, except where indicated.

2 Sample size is n=32.
SAATURN - Limited or No Progress. There were 8 items (26% of the Likert-scale items) for which at least 25% of the respondents endorsed the statement that SAATURN had made limited or no progress. The top two topics for this response category included: (1) creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for victim services (34% of respondents); and (2) using social media or other avenues of information dissemination to increase general public support for victim and prosecutorial efforts in human trafficking issues (31%). Generally, these items refer to activities that would be expected at more advanced stages of the project. These items may be monitored over time to assess improvements as well as identify potential problem areas.

Table 4. Areas in which SAATURN has made limited or no progress from October 2015 - March 2016.

| SAATURN has made limited or no progress | %  
|----------------------------------------|---|
| Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for victim services | 34%  
| Using social media or other avenues of information dissemination to increase general public support for victim and prosecutorial efforts in human trafficking issues | 31%  
| Changing rules, regulations, standards guidelines, and/or practice protocols | 28%  
| Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for law enforcement strategies and activities | 28%  
| Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services | 28%  
| Engaging high level policy or decision makers at the local or regional level | 28%  
| Establishing contact information for SAATURN (e.g., online; phone hotline) | 28%  
| Implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN goals | 25%  

1 Percentage of respondents (all occupations) who report that SAATURN has made limited or no progress in these domains. A criterion of greater than or equal to 25% of the sample was applied to select which items to report. Sample size is n=29, except where indicated.
2 Sample size is n=32.

Perception of SAATURN by Areas of Inquiry/Subscales

The next set of analyses examines respondents’ perception of SAATURN’s progress by area of inquiry (subscales) including: (1) leadership and regulatory issues; (2) training; (3) advocacy; (4) client services; (5) law enforcement and prosecution; and (6) financing. For these analyses, the primary occupation was re-coded to reflect three groups (1) victim services, (2) law enforcement, and (3) other. Participants who reported their primary occupation as either an administrator of a victim services organization, or a victim service provider were classified in the first group (victim service; n = 12). Participants who reported their primary occupation as either an administrator with law enforcement agency, or law enforcement agency provider were classified in the second group (law enforcement; n = 11). Finally, participants who reported their primary occupation as volunteer, homemaker; researcher, foundation officer, counselor, or other public service officer; or other were classified in the third category (other; n = 9). One individual who
self-reported their primary occupation as other was placed in the law enforcement category based on their description of their work in juvenile probation.

Leadership and regulatory issues. This area of inquiry includes six items which are presented in Figures 1-6 below.

**Item 1 - Developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network.**
Figure 1 (below) indicates that 83% of victim service providers, 64% of law enforcement, and 67% of respondents in the other occupational category endorse the statement that SAATURN has made substantial or moderate progress in this area (statistics included only in first graph to orient readers).

![Figure 1](image1.png)

*Figure 1. Developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*

**Item 2 - Strengthening interagency communications between victim services and law enforcement.**
Figure 2 (below) shows that the majority of law enforcement (73%), victim service providers (58%), and other (56%) report that SAATURN made substantial or moderate progress in terms of strengthening interagency communications between victim services and law enforcement.

![Figure 2](image2.png)

*Figure 2. Strengthening interagency communications between victim services and law enforcement: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*
**Item 3 - Changing rules, regulations, standards guidelines, and/or practice protocols.**

Figure 3 (below) shows that perception is divided approximately evenly across response categories for all three occupational groups.

![Figure 3](image)

*Figure 3. Changing rules, regulations, standards guidelines, and/or practice protocols: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*

**Item 4 - Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for victim services.**

Figure 4 (below) indicates that perception is divided across response categories for all three occupational groups. Over 40% of victim service providers indicated that limited or no progress had been made in this area.

![Figure 4](image)

*Figure 4. Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for victim services: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*
**Item 5 - Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for law enforcement strategies and activities.**

Figure 5 (below) indicates that the majority of law enforcement respondents (64%) reported that substantial or moderate progress occurred with regard to creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for law enforcement strategies and activities. This is in contrast to victim service providers, of whom 75% reported either limited or no progress or not knowing what progress had been made. This discrepancy between law enforcement and victim service provider perceptions may indicate that the coalition would benefit from more inter-agency communication about this topic.

![Figure 5: Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for law enforcement strategies and activities](chart1)

*Figure 5. Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for law enforcement strategies and activities: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*

**Item 6 - Implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN’s goals.**

Figure 6 (below) indicates that over 40% of law enforcement respondents reported substantial or moderate progress in implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN goals. Victim service providers and other occupations tended to report not knowing about progress in this area.

![Figure 6: Implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN goals](chart2)

*Figure 6. Implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN goals: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*
Findings from the “leadership and regulatory” area of inquiry are bolstered by responses to open-ended questions about advancements in the area of leadership and regulatory issues. For example:

“[They] have been instrumental in scheduling the monthly meetings; training and collaboration amongst agencies. This has helped establish the points of contact for each committee; contributing agencies from Southern Arizona to streamline how efficiently we operate and respond.”

“The interagency collaboration is much more cohesive now. There is a clear understanding of agency contacts.”

“Bringing stakeholders together across three counties. This is not easy given the diverse stakeholders involved in SAATURN (such as victims of trafficking; law enforcement; treatment agencies). Everyone seems to committed and wants to make a difference.”

Training Issues. This area of inquiry includes six items which are presented in Figures 7-12 below.

Item 1 - Developing and standardizing training materials including terms and definitions.
Figure 7 (below) indicates that the majority of both victim services (60%) and law enforcement (60%) reported that there was substantial or moderate progress with regard to developing and standardizing training materials including terms and definitions.

![Developing and standardizing training materials including terms and definitions](image)

*Figure 7. Developing and standardizing training materials including terms and definitions: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*

Item 2 - Training on victim screening and identification criteria.
Figure 8 (below) indicates that 40% of victim service providers and law enforcement reported that substantial or moderate progress had been made. On the other hand, a large percentage of victim service providers (50%) and those from other occupations (56%) reported not knowing whether progress had been made in this area.
**Item 3 - Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services.**

Figure 9 (below) indicates that 40% of law enforcement and 30% of victim service providers reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. However, 50% of victim service providers and 56% of other occupations reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

**Item 4 - Training on identification of illegal trafficking activity.**

Figure 10 (below) indicates that the majority of law enforcement (70%) reported that there was substantial or moderate progress with regard to training on identification of illegal trafficking activity. Victim service providers were split on this topic, with 40% reporting substantial or moderate progress and 50% reporting not knowing whether progress had been made.
**Figure 10.** Training on identification of illegal trafficking activity: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

**Item 5 -** Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrests and convictions of trafficking offenders and/or the other matters related to human trafficking activity. Figure 11 (below) indicates that 50% of law enforcement reported substantial or moderate progress in this area, while 60% of victim service providers and 67% of other occupations reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

**Figure 11.** Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrests and convictions of trafficking offenders and/or the other matters related to human trafficking activity: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.
Item 6 - Training or activities to increase general public awareness of human trafficking issues. Figure 12 (below) indicates that 40% of victim service providers and 50% of law enforcement reported substantial or moderate progress in training or activities to increase general public awareness of human trafficking issues.

Findings from the “training issues” area of inquiry are bolstered by responses to open-ended questions about advancements with regard to training. For example:

“Regular training opportunities have been available in the past 6 months. The effort to advance learning; understanding and proper response from all agencies to victims of human/sex trafficking has also included bringing everyone involved with SAATURN up to the same level.”

“Agencies from across the state; in law enforcement and Non-Governmental organizations; have been very receptive to the mission of the grant and learning more about how they might be able to contribute. The networking amongst agencies has been invaluable and has opened doors to training and information that we might not have otherwise known about.”

Advocacy Issues. This area of inquiry includes six items which are presented in Figures 13-18 below.

Item 1 - Engaging high level policy or decision makers at the local or regional level. Figure 13 (below) indicates that a large percentage of both victim service providers (60%) and law enforcement (40%) do not know what progress has been made in this area.
Figure 13. Engaging high level policy or decision makers at the local or regional level: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

Item 2 - Engaging victims of trafficking in SAATURN so that their views and voices are represented.
Figure 14 (below) indicates that 50% of law enforcement and 40% of victim service providers reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. A large minority (40% for both law enforcement and victim service providers) also reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

Figure 14. Engaging victims of trafficking in SAATURN so that their views and voices are represented: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

Item 3 - Cultivating partnerships with other key stakeholders.
Figure 15 (below) indicates that at least half of all respondents from the three occupational categories reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. However, a large minority of victim service providers (40%) reported limited or no progress in this area.
**Figure 15.** Cultivating partnerships with other key stakeholders: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

**Item 4 - Expanding the victim services provider network to provide more services and more comprehensive services.**

Figure 16 (below) indicates that 44% of respondents from other occupations reported substantial or moderate progress in this area followed by victim service providers (40%). However, a large minority of law enforcement (40%) and victim service providers (40%) also indicated that they did not know whether progress had been made.

**Figure 16.** Expanding the victim services provider network to provide more services and more comprehensive services: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

**Item 5 - Establishing contact information for SAATURN (e.g., online; phone hotline).**

Figure 17 (below) indicates that 50% of law enforcement reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. Victim services providers were approximately evenly distributed across the response categories, with slightly more (40%) reporting not knowing whether progress had been made.
Figure 17. Establishing contact information for SAATURN (e.g., on-line; phone hotline): Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

**Item 6 - Using social media or other avenues of information dissemination to increase general public support for victim and prosecutorial efforts in human trafficking issues.**

Figure 18 (below) indicates that 40% of law enforcement reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. However, 0% of victim service providers agreed that substantial or moderate progress had been made and the majority (70%) reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

Figure 18. Using social media or other avenues of information dissemination to increase general public support for victim and prosecutorial efforts in human trafficking issues: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

Findings from the “advocacy” area of inquiry are bolstered by responses to open-ended questions about advancements in the area of advocacy. For example:

"Law enforcement training has really increased in an attempt to educate officers so they have increased knowledge on warning signs and how to handle."
“The introduction of survivors to the law enforcement meeting last week was a substantial step in movement.”

Client Services Issues. This area of inquiry included five items which are presented in Figures 19-23 below.

**Item 1 - Creating or expanding a broad array of services.**
Figure 19 (below) indicates that 40% of victim service providers and 50% of law enforcement reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. However, the majority of victim service providers (60%) reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

![Figure 19](image1.png)

*Figure 19. Creating or expanding a broad array of services: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*

**Item 2 - Collaborating and coordinating between victim services organizations in Southern Arizona.**
Figure 20 (below) indicates that 40% of victim service providers and 56% of other occupations reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. A large minority of victim service providers (40%) and law enforcement (40%) reported not knowing whether progress had been made in this area.

![Figure 20](image2.png)

*Figure 20. Collaborating and coordinating between victim services organizations in Southern Arizona: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*
**Item 3 - Victim identification, screening, and timely access to services.**

Figure 21 (below) indicates that 40% of law enforcement reported substantial or moderate progress. However, 50% of victim service providers and 40% of law enforcement reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

![Graph](image.png)

*Figure 21. Victim identification, screening, and timely access to services: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*

**Item 4 - The use of evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services.**

Figure 22 (below) indicates that 50% of law enforcement report substantial or moderate progress in this area. On the other hand, 50% of victim service providers and 67% of other occupations reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

![Graph](image.png)

*Figure 22. The use of evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*
Item 5 - Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender issues.

Figure 23 (below) indicates that 40% of law enforcement reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. However, 60% of victim service providers, 50% of law enforcement, and 56% of other occupations reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

![Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender issues](image)

**Figure 23.** Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender issues: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

Although the responses to the “client services” area of inquiry indicated a lack of awareness across all three occupational groups, some responses to the open-ended questions about client services were optimistic. For example:

“I have been involved in the meetings with the victim services subcommittee. The number of agencies who want to be a part of this task force; the skills; abilities and resources they all bring to the table has been very impressive. They are hammering out the details on the protocols and how they will respond when a victim has been identified. This includes the types of service needs identified and case management to ensure no one slips through the cracks.”

Law Enforcement and Prosecution. This area of inquiry includes five items which are presented in Figures 24-28 below.

**Item 1 – Creating or expanding a broad array of strategies to advance law enforcement and prosecution efforts.**

Figure 24 (below) indicates that 80% of law enforcement, 50% of victim service providers, and 56% of other occupations reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. A large minority of victim service providers (40%) and other occupations (44%) reported not knowing whether progress had been made.
Creating or expanding a broad array of strategies to advance law enforcement and prosecution efforts: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

Item 2 – Collaborating and coordinating between law enforcement agencies in Southern Arizona.
Figure 25 (below) indicates that the majority of respondents in law enforcement (80%), victim services (70%), and other occupations (56%) agree that substantial or moderate progress was made in this area.

Collaborating and coordinating between law enforcement agencies in Southern Arizona: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

Item 3 – Identification and timely arrest, arraignment, due-process, and convictions of trafficking offenders.
Figure 26 (below) indicates that 70% of law enforcement reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. Both victim service providers (80%) and other occupations (78%) appeared to be unaware of this progress, and reported not knowing whether progress had been made.
Figure 26. Identification and timely arrest, arraignment, due-process, and convictions of trafficking offenders: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

Item 4 – Using evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrest and conviction of offenders of human trafficking.
Figure 27 (below) indicates that 50% of law enforcement reported substantial or moderate progress in this area, while 60% of victim service providers and 78% of other occupations reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

Figure 27. Using evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrest and conviction of offenders of human trafficking: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

Item 5 – Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender bias.
Figure 28 (below) indicates that 60% of law enforcement reported substantial or moderate progress in this area. Victim service providers (80%) and other occupations (78%) reported not knowing whether progress had been made.
Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender bias:

Figure 28. Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender bias: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.

Findings from the “law enforcement and prosecution” area of inquiry are bolstered by the responses to open-ended questions about advancements in law enforcement and prosecution. Respondents noted that the greatest advances came from developing partnerships with Homeland Security, the U.S. Attorney’s Office, and the Tucson Police Department. For example:

“Open lines of communication with the U.S. Attorney's Office has been our greatest asset”

Financing Issues. This area of inquiry includes three items which are presented in Figures 29-31 below.

Item 1 – Filling gaps in services through new funding or interagency agreements and partnerships. Figure 29 (below) indicates that law enforcement respondents were fairly evenly distributed across response options, while both victim service providers (80%) and respondents from other occupations (67%) reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

Figure 29. Filling gaps in services through new funding or interagency agreements and partnerships: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.
Item 2 – Creating or improving financing mechanisms and using funding resources strategically.

Figure 30 (below) indicates that law enforcement respondents were fairly evenly distributed across response options, while both victim service providers (80%) and respondents from other occupations (78%) reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

![Figure 30](image)

*Figure 30. Creating or improving financing mechanisms and using funding resources strategically: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*

Item 3 – Conducting cross training or other activities to address sustaining issues.

Figure 31 (below) indicates that law enforcement respondents were fairly evenly distributed across response options, while both victim service providers (80%) and respondents from other occupations (67%) reported not knowing whether progress had been made.

![Figure 31](image)

*Figure 31. Conducting cross training or other activities to address sustaining issues: Percent of respondents endorsing response categories within each occupational category.*

Successes, Challenges, and Recommendations

As indicated by the responses to this Qualtrics survey, SAATURN has made substantial progress in a number of areas. As expected, the areas in which the greatest progress was made during this reporting period (October 2015 - March 2016) are with regard to coalition building. Notable progress was
perceived, for example, with regard to “developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network,” “collaborating and coordinating between law enforcement agencies in Southern Arizona,” and “strengthening interagency communications between victim services and law enforcement.” In addition, respondents perceived notable progress with regard to law enforcement activities, including for example “creating or expanding a broad array of strategies to advance law enforcement and prosecution efforts.” These and other advances are particularly impressive given that this data is reflective of the first six months of SAATURN funding.

Responses to the open-ended questions in the Qualtrics survey also reflect that respondents understand the challenges and the time it takes to build an anti-trafficking coalition across a large geographical area (Southern Arizona) and across professional areas (law enforcement and victim services). In addition, understanding the benefits of contributing one’s efforts and expertise to the coalition takes time. For example:

“Time. Everything takes time…SAATURN is just starting up!”

“I wish more agencies would focus on SAATURN as opposed to ONLY their organization’s mission. I know both are important but I also feel that agencies are present to see what SAATURN can do for them as opposed to what they can do for SAATURN and the victims we are hoping to be able to help through this grant.”

SAATURN also faced challenges during this reporting period that might have impeded its potential progress. Both the TPD and CODAC experienced administrative restructuring, leaving key SAATURN staff without the support they had anticipated when applying for the Department of Justice grant. Respondents noted that these changes may have delayed the rate of progress expected by survey respondents while others rallied for more people to actively contribute to SAATURN development. For example:

“All of the responsibility is falling on 1-2 people. There is no way this can succeed unless others step to the plate.”

“Give SAATURN time and room to grow. We’re just getting started!”

Recommendations for SAATURN were made by several respondents. These include: (1) continue regular meetings to keep stakeholders informed; (2) continue development of protocols and training materials for both the law enforcement and victim service provider sides; (3) consider distributing a monthly newsletter or email blast on SAATURN developments, important dates, and training opportunities; and (4) have individuals involved in SAATURN take a more active role in its development to help distribute the work involved in getting the coalition up and running.

Narrative responses articulate recommendations specific to training and outreach:
“I have recommended the use of a learning management tool similar to Classroom 24/7 for several reasons: 1) cost-saving capability that doesn't rely on training staff; 2) keeps track of performance and attendance; 3) outreach is unlimited.”

“I think it would be to our benefit to bring in a successful program from another state to train us. It seems as if there is a large learning curve.”

“SAATURN needs to develop a public image; share its progress with the public and without more funding SAATURN will need more volunteers requiring more integration with the public.”

In summary, SAATURN has made a great deal of progress during its first six months of coalition building. While setbacks and challenges exist, but they are not insurmountable. Given SAATURN’s productive first six months, advances with regard to SAATURN are expected during future reporting periods. Continued progress is expected as the number of trainings and other activities are offered, outreach and awareness is increased, additional people become involved, and protocols are developed.
Appendix A
Qualtrics Survey

You have been identified as a stakeholder in the Southern Arizona Anti-Trafficking Unified Response Network (SAATURN). We are interested in your perception of the progress that SAATURN has made during the six-month time frame, October 1, 2015 to March 31, 2016.

This survey will take 10-15 minutes to complete. All responses are confidential, unless you include identifying information in the open-ended questions since these responses will be transcribed verbatim. Summary results of the survey will be shared at the SAATURN quarterly meeting. Your feedback is important to the SAATURN project. These are questions about your perception--there is no right or wrong response.

Thank you for your assistance!

The following questions will ask some background information.

1. What is your age? ____
2. What is your gender?
   - Male
   - Female
   - Transgender
3. What is your race?
   - Asian/Pacific Islander
   - Black/African American
   - Caucasian/White
   - Latina/o
   - Middle Eastern
   - Native American/Alaska Native
   - Mixed Race (specific) ____
   - Other/Declined
4. What county do you live in?
   - Cochise
   - Pima
   - Santa Cruz
   - Other ____
5. Do you serve on a SAATURN Subcommittee?
   - No
   - Yes, Victim Service
   - Yes, Outreach & Training
   - Yes, Law Enforcement
6. What is your primary occupation?
   - Administrator of victim services organization
- Victim service provider (e.g., therapist, case manager, nurse, attorney)
- Administrator with law enforcement agency
- Law enforcement agency provider (e.g., police officer, sheriff officer, dispatcher)
- Volunteer, homemaker
- Researcher, foundation officer, counselor or other public service officer
- Other _____

The next questions are about leadership and regulatory issues.

In the past six months (October 2015 - March 2016) has SAATURN made progress in the area of leadership and regulatory issues?

(Response options)

SAATURN has made substantial progress
SAATURN has made some progress
SAATURN has made limited progress
SAATURN has made no progress
Don’t know

7. Developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network
8. Strengthening interagency communications between victim services and law enforcement
9. Changing rules, regulations, standards guidelines, and/or practice protocols
10. Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for victim services
11. Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for law enforcement strategies and activities
12. Implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN goals

(Open-ended questions)

13. What were the greatest advancements in the area of leadership and regulatory issues during this time period? If you think that there have been no advancements in the past six months, then type "none."
14. What barriers were there to advancing leadership and regulatory issues during this time period? If you think that there have been no barriers in the past six months, then type "none."

The next questions are about training.

In the past six months (October 2015 - March 2016) has SAATURN made progress in the area of training?

(Response options)

SAATURN has made substantial progress
SAATURN has made some progress
SAATURN has made limited progress
SAATURN has made no progress
Don’t know
15. Developing and standardizing training materials including terms and definitions
16. Training on victim screening and identification criteria
17. Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services
18. Training on identification of illegal trafficking activity
19. Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrests and convictions of trafficking offenders and/or the other matters related to human trafficking activity
20. Training or activities to increase general public awareness of human trafficking issues

(Open-ended questions)

21. What were the greatest advancements in training during this time period? If you think that there have been no advancements in the past six months, then type "none."
22. What barriers were there to advancing training during this time period? If you think that there have been no barriers in the past six months, then type "none."

The next questions are about advocacy.

In the past six months (October 2015 - March 2016) has SAATURN made progress in the area of advocacy?

(Response options)

SAATURN has made substantial progress
SAATURN has made some progress
SAATURN has made limited progress
SAATURN has made no progress
Don’t know

23. Engaging high level policy or decision makers at the local or regional level
24. Engaging victims of trafficking in SAATURN so that their views and voices are represented
25. Cultivating partnerships with other key stakeholders
26. Expanding the victims services provider network to provide more services and more comprehensive services
27. Establishing contact information for SAATURN (e.g., online; phone hotline)
28. Using social media or other avenues of information dissemination to increase general public support for victim and prosecutorial efforts in human trafficking issues

(Open-ended questions)

29. What were the greatest advancements in the area of developing advocacy during this time period? If you think that there have been no advancements in the past six months, then type "none."
30. What were the barriers to advancing advocacy during this time period? If you think that there have been no barriers in the past six months, then type "none."

The next questions are about client services.
In the past six months (October 2015 - March 2016) has SAATURN made progress in the area of client services?

(Response options)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SAATURN has</th>
<th>SAATURN has</th>
<th>SAATURN has</th>
<th>SAATURN has</th>
<th>Don’t know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>made substantial</td>
<td>made some</td>
<td>made limited</td>
<td>made no progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>progress</td>
<td>progress</td>
<td>progress</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

31. Creating or expanding a broad array of services
32. Collaborating and coordinating between victim services organizations in Southern Arizona
33. Victim identification, screening, and timely access to services
34. The use of evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services
35. Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender issues

(Open-ended questions)

36. What were the greatest advancements in the area of developing client services during this time period? If you think that there have been no advancements in the past six months, then type "none."
37. What were the barriers to advancing client services during this time period? If you think that there have been no barriers in the past six months, then type "none."

The next questions are about law enforcement and prosecution.

In the past six months (October 2015 - March 2016) has SAATURN made progress in the area of law enforcement and prosecution?

(Response options)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SAATURN has</th>
<th>SAATURN has</th>
<th>SAATURN has</th>
<th>SAATURN has</th>
<th>Don’t know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>made substantial</td>
<td>made some</td>
<td>made limited</td>
<td>made no progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>progress</td>
<td>progress</td>
<td>progress</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

38. Creating or expanding a broad array of strategies to advance law enforcement and prosecution efforts
39. Collaborating and coordinating between law enforcement agencies in Southern Arizona
40. Identification and timely arrest, arraignment, due-process, and convictions of trafficking offenders
41. Using evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrest and conviction of offenders of human trafficking
42. Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender bias
(Open-ended questions)

43. What were the greatest advancements in the area of law enforcement and prosecution during this time period? If you think that there have been no advancements in the past six months, then type "none."

44. What were the barriers to advancing law enforcement and prosecution during this time period? If you think that there have been no barriers in the past six months, then type "none."

The next questions are about financing.

In the past six months (October 2015 - March 2016) has SAATURN made progress in the area of financing?

(Response options)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SAATURN has made substantial progress</th>
<th>SAATURN has made some progress</th>
<th>SAATURN has made limited progress</th>
<th>SAATURN has made no progress</th>
<th>Don’t know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

45. Filling gaps in services through new funding or interagency agreements and partnerships
46. Creating or improving financing mechanisms and using funding resources strategically
47. Conducting cross training or other activities to address sustaining issues

(Open-ended questions)

48. What were the greatest advancements in the area of financing during this time period? If you think that there have been no advancements in the past six months, then type "none."

49. What were the barriers to advancing financing during this time period? If you think that there have been no barriers in the past six months, then type "none."

(Open-ended, general questions)

50. In the past six months (October 2015 - March 2016) what were the three greatest advancements or successes of SAATURN? If you cannot think of three responses, please type "N/A" into any remaining fields.

51. In the past six months (October 2015-March 2016) have you noticed any new trends or activities that SAATURN should be aware of? If you think that there have been no new trends, then type "none."

52. Are there specific issues that SAATURN should address in the next 6-12 months? If you cannot think of any specific issues, then type "none."
Appendix B
Figures for all Likert-Scale Items
Leadership and regulatory issues at a glance...

From October 2015 to March 2016, progress has been:

- Developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network
- Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for victim services
- Strengthening interagency communications between victim services and law enforcement
- Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for law enforcement strategies and activities
- Changing rules, regulations, standards guidelines, and/or practice protocols
- Implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN goals

Sample size is n=52.
Training issues at a glance...

From October 2015 to March 2016, progress has been:

Sample size is n=29.
Advocacy issues at a glance...

From October 2015 to March 2016, progress has been:

- Engaging high level policy or decision makers at the local or regional level
- Expanding the victims services provider network to provide more services and more comprehensive services
- Engaging victims of trafficking in SAATURN so that their views and voices are represented
- Establishing contact information for SAATURN (e.g., online; phone hotline)
- Cultivating partnerships with other key stakeholders
- Using social media or other avenues of information dissemination to increase general public support for victim and prosecutorial efforts in human trafficking issues

Sample size is n=29.
Client services issues at a glance...

From October 2015 to March 2016, progress has been:

- Creating or expanding a broad array of services
- The use of evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services
- Collaborating and coordinating between victim services organizations in Southern Arizona
- Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender issues
- Victim identification, screening, and timely access to services

Sample size is n=29.
Law enforcement and prosecution issues at a glance...

From October 2015 to March 2016, progress has been:

- Creating or expanding a broad array of strategies to advance law enforcement and prosecution efforts
- Using evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrest and conviction of offenders of human trafficking
- Collaborating and coordinating between law enforcement agencies in Southern Arizona
- Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender bias

Percent Endorsing Statement Within Each Occupational Category

Identification and timely arrest, arraignment, due-process, and convictions of trafficking offenders

Sample size is n=29.
Financing issues at a glance...

From October 2015 to March 2016, progress has been:

- Filling gaps in services through new funding or interagency agreements and partnerships
- Creating or improving financing mechanisms and using funding resources strategically
- Conducting cross training or other activities to address sustaining issues

Sample size is n=29.
Appendix C
Secondary and Tertiary Analyses
The UA-SIROW evaluation team conducted secondary and tertiary analyses of the Qualtrics items to illuminate nuances in the data. While the data presented in the main body of this report depict the percent of respondents within each occupational category endorsing the three response options, the second method of displaying the data focuses on the distribution of respondent occupations within each response category (e.g., Figure 32 below). These data (detailed in the following graphs) are useful for understanding which occupational groups are represented within a given response category.

**Figure 32.** Developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network: Distribution of respondent occupations within each response category.

A tertiary set of analyses (e.g., Figure 33 and also depicted in the graphs below) present the data as the raw number of respondents for each response category, while still disaggregating by occupational category. The tertiary analyses are intended to supplement the information presented using secondary analyses because the latter format only includes the percentages of occupational categories represented for each response category, but does not include the raw numbers of respondents. Thus, the two graphs (for the secondary and tertiary analyses) should be considered in conjunction with one another in order to glean the clearest picture of the response patterns of respondents. The graphs depicting these secondary and tertiary analyses are presented below.

**Figure 33.** Developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network: Number of respondents.
Progress in Leadership and Regulatory Issues from October 2015 to March 2016

Developing and maintaining an organized, effective, unified response network

- Substantial or Moderate
- Limited or None
- Don't Know

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

- Victim Services
- Law Enforcement
- Other

Strengthening interagency communications between victim services and law enforcement

- Substantial or Moderate
- Limited or None
- Don't Know

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

Number of Respondents

0 5 10 15 20 25
Progress in *Leadership and Regulatory Issues* from October 2015 to March 2016

**Changing rules, regulations, standards, guidelines, and/or practice protocols**

**Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for victim services**

- **Victim Services**
- **Law Enforcement**
- **Other**

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

Number of Respondents
Progress in *Leadership and Regulatory Issues* from October 2015 to March 2016

Creating and adopting Southern Arizona wide protocols for law enforcement strategies and activities

Implementing and utilizing evaluation to advance SAATURN goals

- Substantial or Moderate
- Limited or None
- Don’t Know

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

Number of Respondents
Progress in *Training* from October 2015 to March 2016

Developing and standardizing training materials including terms and definitions

- **Substantial or Moderate**
- **Limited or None**
- **Don’t Know**

Training on victim screening and identification criteria

- **Substantial or Moderate**
- **Limited or None**
- **Don’t Know**
Progress in *Training* from October 2015 to March 2016

Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services

- **Substantial or Moderate**
- **Limited or None**
- **Don’t Know**

Training on identification of illegal trafficking activity

- **Substantial or Moderate**
- **Limited or None**
- **Don’t Know**

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

Number of Respondents
Progress in *Training* from October 2015 to March 2016

Training on evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrests and convictions of trafficking offenders and/or the other matters related to human trafficking activity

Training or activities to increase general public awareness of human trafficking issues

**Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category**
Progress in *Advocacy* from October 2015 to March 2016

Engaging high level policy or decision makers at the local or regional level

Engaging victims of trafficking in SAATURN so that their views and voices are represented

**Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category**

**Number of Respondents**

- Substantial or Moderate
- Limited or None
- Don’t Know
Progress in *Advocacy* from October 2015 to March 2016

Cultivating partnerships with other key stakeholders

- **Substantial or Moderate**
- **Limited or None**
- **Don’t Know**

Expanding the victim services provider network to provide more services and more comprehensive services

- **Victim Services**
- **Law Enforcement**
- **Other**
Progress in **Advocacy** from October 2015 to March 2016

**Establishing contact information for SAATURN** (e.g., on-line; phone hotline)

- Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

- Number of Respondents

**Using social media or other avenues of information dissemination to increase general public support for victim and prosecutorial efforts in human trafficking issues**

- Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

- Number of Respondents
Progress in **Client Services** from October 2015 to March 2016

Creating or expanding a broad array of services

Collaborating and coordinating between victim services organizations in Southern Arizona

---

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

- **Substantial or Moderate**
- **Limited or None**
- **Don’t Know**

Number of Respondents:

0 5 10 15 20 25

---

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

- **Substantial or Moderate**
- **Limited or None**
- **Don’t Know**

Number of Respondents:

0 5 10 15 20 25
Progress in **Client Services** from October 2015 to March 2016

Victim identification, screening, and timely access to services

- Substantial or Moderate
- Limited or None
- Don’t Know

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

The use of evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to victim services

- Substantial or Moderate
- Limited or None
- Don’t Know

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category
Progress in *Client Services* from October 2015 to March 2016

Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Substantial or Moderate</th>
<th>Limited or None</th>
<th>Don’t Know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Victim Services</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law Enforcement</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

Number of Respondents

0  5  10  15  20  25
Progress in *Law Enforcement and Prosecution* from October 2015 to March 2016

Creating or expanding a broad array of strategies to advance law enforcement and prosecution efforts

Collaborating and coordinating between law enforcement agencies in Southern Arizona

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

- Substantial or Moderate
- Limited or None
- Don’t Know

Number of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Victim Services</th>
<th>Law Enforcement</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Substantial or Moderate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited or None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t Know</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

58
Progress in **Law Enforcement and Prosecution** from October 2015 to March 2016

Identification and timely arrest, arraignment, due process, and convictions of trafficking offenders

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substantial or Moderate</th>
<th>Limited or None</th>
<th>Don’t Know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Using evidence-informed and practice-based evidence approaches to arrest and conviction of offenders of human trafficking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Substantial or Moderate</th>
<th>Limited or None</th>
<th>Don’t Know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

Number of Respondents

0 5 10 15 20

0 15 30 45 60

Victim Services
Law Enforcement
Other
Progress in *Law Enforcement and Prosecution* from October 2015 to March 2016

Utilizing cultural and linguistically competent approaches that are sensitive to racial and gender bias

- Substantial or Moderate
- Limited or None
- Don’t Know

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

Number of Respondents
Progress in Financing from October 2015 to March 2016

Filling gaps in services through new funding or interagency agreements and partnerships:
- Substantial or Moderate
- Limited or None
- Don’t Know

Creating or improving financing mechanisms and using funding resources strategically:
- Substantial or Moderate
- Limited or None
- Don’t Know

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

Number of Respondents
Progress in *Financing* from October 2015 to March 2016

Conducting cross training or other activities to address sustaining issues

- **Substantial or Moderate**
- **Limited or None**
- **Don’t Know**

Distribution of Respondent Occupations within Each Response Category

- **Victim Services**
- **Law Enforcement**
- **Other**

Number of Respondents